

# A RIGIDITY ESTIMATE FOR MAPS FROM $S^2$ TO $S^2$ VIA THE HARMONIC MAP FLOW

Peter M. Topping

22 September 2020

## Abstract

We show how a rigidity estimate introduced in recent work of Bernand-Mantel, Muratov and Simon [1] can be derived from the harmonic map flow theory in [9].

## 1 Introduction

For maps  $u \in W^{1,2}(S^2, S^2)$ , consider the harmonic map energy

$$E(u) = \frac{1}{2} \int |Du|^2.$$

Following Schoen-Uhlenbeck [4] we know that such a map can be approximated in  $W^{1,2}(S^2, S^2)$  by smooth maps  $u_i$ , whose degree will stabilise at some integer that gives a well-defined notion of degree of  $u$ . See also [7, Theorem 6.2]. For smooth maps  $w$  from a surface to any Riemannian manifold, a simple computation confirms that  $E(w)$  is always at least the area of the image of  $w$ , with equality if  $w$  is weakly conformal. This implies that degree  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  maps from  $S^2$  to itself must have energy at least  $4\pi k$ , with equality implying that the map is a rational map. A special case of this is that if  $u$  is of degree one then  $E(u) \geq 4\pi$  with equality if and only if  $u$  is a Möbius map.

The following theorem was recently proved by Bernand-Mantel, Muratov and Simon [1].

**Theorem 1.1.** *There exists a universal constant  $C < \infty$  such that for each  $u \in W^{1,2}(S^2, S^2)$  of degree one, there exists a Möbius map  $v : S^2 \rightarrow S^2$  such that*

$$\int |D(u - v)|^2 \leq C[E(u) - 4\pi].$$

The purpose of this note is to show that the estimate above can be derived from the theory of the harmonic map flow developed in [9].

## 2 The harmonic map flow from surfaces

The harmonic map flow [2] is the  $L^2$ -gradient flow for the harmonic map energy. If we view a flow  $u : S^2 \times [0, T) \rightarrow S^2 \hookrightarrow \mathbb{R}^3$  as taking values in  $\mathbb{R}^3$ , then the equation in this case can be written

$$\frac{\partial u}{\partial t} = \tau(u) := (\Delta u)^T$$

where  $(\Delta u)^T$  is the projection of  $\Delta u$  onto the tangent space of the target, i.e.  $(\Delta u)^T = \Delta u + u|Du|^2$ . The energy  $E(t) := E(u(t))$  decays according to

$$\frac{dE}{dt} = -\|\tau(u)\|_{L^2(S^2)}^2. \quad (2.1)$$

In 1985 Struwe [6] initiated a theory for the harmonic map flow in the case that the domain is a surface, as it is here. He showed how one can start a flow with smooth or even  $W^{1,2}$  initial data, giving a global weak solution that is smooth away from finitely many points in space-time, at which bubbling occurs. At each finite-time singularity, concentrated energy at the singular points is thrown away by taking a weak limit, and the flow restarted. Thus, the energy drops down at each singular time by at least the minimum energy of one bubble, i.e. of a nonconstant harmonic map from  $S^2$  to the target. However, the map  $t \mapsto u(t)$  is continuous into  $L^2$ , even across singular times. (Later [10], different continuations through certain singularities were constructed that did not require a drop in energy, but we will not need them here.)

Concerning the asymptotics at infinite time, there exists a sequence  $t_i \rightarrow \infty$  such that maps  $u(t_i)$  converge smoothly to a limiting harmonic map  $u_\infty$  away from finitely many bubble points. (See, for example, [7].) In general, even in the absence of bubbling, convergence of the form  $u(t) \rightarrow u_\infty$  as  $t \rightarrow \infty$  may fail, even in  $L^1$ , see [8, 9]. However, a theory was developed in [9, 11] concerning such uniform convergence for maps from  $S^2$  to itself. A key lemma from that work, which will be useful to us now, gives a relationship between the tension field of a map  $u$  and its excess energy. It differed from previous estimates of ‘Lojasiewicz-Simon’ type [5] in that it could handle singular objects. In particular the map  $u$  below is not asked to be  $W^{1,2}$  close to a harmonic map.

**Lemma 2.1** ([9, Lemma 1]). *There exist universal constants  $\epsilon_0 > 0$  and  $\kappa > 0$  such that if a smooth degree  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  map  $u : S^2 \rightarrow S^2$  satisfies  $E(u) - 4\pi|k| < \epsilon_0$ , then*

$$E(u) - 4\pi|k| \leq \kappa^2 \|\tau(u)\|_{L^2}^2.$$

As is well known, such an estimate gives control on the gradient flow. Indeed, given a smooth solution  $u : S^2 \times [0, T] \rightarrow S^2$  that is of degree  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , and satisfies  $E(u) - 4\pi|k| < \epsilon_0$  at time  $t = 0$  (and therefore also for later times) we can compute using (2.1) and then Lemma 2.1 that

$$-\frac{d}{dt} [E(u) - 4\pi|k|]^{\frac{1}{2}} = \frac{1}{2} [E(u) - 4\pi|k|]^{-\frac{1}{2}} \|\tau(u)\|_{L^2}^2 \geq \frac{1}{2\kappa} \|\tau(u)\|_{L^2}$$

and integrating from  $t = s \in [0, T)$  to  $t = T$  gives

$$\begin{aligned} \int_s^T \|\tau(u)\|_{L^2} dt &\leq 2\kappa \left( [E(u(s)) - 4\pi|k|]^{\frac{1}{2}} - [E(u(T)) - 4\pi|k|]^{\frac{1}{2}} \right) \\ &\leq 2\kappa [E(u(s)) - 4\pi|k|]^{\frac{1}{2}}. \end{aligned} \quad (2.2)$$

Since  $\frac{\partial u}{\partial t} = \tau(u)$ , the flow then cannot move far in  $L^2$ :

$$\|u(T) - u(s)\|_{L^2} \leq 2\kappa [E(u(s)) - 4\pi|k|]^{\frac{1}{2}}. \quad (2.3)$$

### 3 Proof of Theorem 1.1

*Proof.* First, if  $E(u) = 4\pi$ , then  $u$  must be a Möbius map and we can choose  $v = u$ , so from now on we may assume that  $E(u) > 4\pi$ . By approximation, using the definition of degree, it suffices to prove the result for  $u \in C^\infty(S^2, S^2)$ . Since the estimate is invariant under pre-composition by Möbius maps, it suffices to prove the theorem for  $u$  equal to a map  $u_0$  with the property that  $\int_{S^2} u_0 = 0 \in \mathbb{R}^3$ . That this can be achieved follows from a topological argument: For  $a \in B^3$ , let  $\varphi_a : S^2 \rightarrow S^2$  be the Möbius map that fixes  $\pm \frac{a}{|a|}$ , whose differential does not rotate the tangent spaces at  $\pm \frac{a}{|a|}$ , and which when extended to a conformal map  $B^3 \mapsto B^3$  will send the origin to  $a$ . Thus as  $a$  approaches some  $a_0 \in S^2 = \partial B^3$ , the composition  $u \circ \varphi_a$  converges to  $u(a_0)$  away from  $-a_0$ , so  $\frac{1}{4\pi} \int u \circ \varphi_a \rightarrow u(a_0)$ . Thus the map

$$a \mapsto \frac{1}{4\pi} \int u \circ \varphi_a$$

extends to a continuous map  $\Phi$  from  $\overline{B^3}$  to itself that agrees with the degree one map  $u$  on the boundary  $S^2$ . A topological argument then tells us that  $\Phi$  is surjective, since otherwise  $\Phi$  could be homotoped to a continuous map  $\tilde{\Phi}$  from  $\overline{B^3}$  to  $S^2$  that restricts to  $u : S^2 \rightarrow S^2$ . But then  $\tilde{\Phi}$  would provide a homotopy from the degree one map  $u$  to a constant map, a contradiction. In particular, there exists  $a \in B^3$  such that  $\Phi(a) = 0 \in B^3$ . We can then set  $u_0 := u \circ \varphi_a$  to achieve our objective. For a related argument in which one *post*-composes with Möbius maps see Li-Yau [3].

Let now  $\epsilon_0$  be as in the key lemma 2.1. For later use, if necessary we reduce  $\epsilon_0 > 0$  so that

$$(1 + 4\kappa^2)\epsilon_0 \leq \pi. \quad (3.1)$$

We may assume that our map  $u_0$  satisfies  $E(u_0) - 4\pi < \epsilon_0$  since otherwise the theorem is vacuously true.

To prove the theorem, run the harmonic map flow starting with  $u_0$ . By (2.3), the flow is constrained in how far it can move in  $L^2$ . Because of the balancing  $\int_{S^2} u_0 = 0$ , this implies that  $\int_{S^2} u(t)$  remains close to the origin, which precludes bubbling both at finite and infinite time. More precisely, because

$$\frac{d}{dt} \int u = \int \tau(u)$$

we have

$$\left| \frac{d}{dt} \int u \right| \leq 2\sqrt{\pi} \|\tau(u)\|_{L^2},$$

and therefore, integrating from 0 to  $t$  using (2.2) we have

$$\left| \int u(t) \right| \leq \frac{\kappa}{\sqrt{\pi}} [E(u_0) - 4\pi]^{\frac{1}{2}}. \quad (3.2)$$

Suppose we develop a singularity at a finite or infinite time  $T \in (0, \infty]$ . If we pick  $t_i \uparrow T$  such that  $u(t_i) \rightharpoonup w$  weakly in  $W^{1,2}$ , then we must have  $E(w) \leq E(u_0) - 4\pi$ , since the singularity loses at least  $4\pi$  of energy (that being the least possible energy of a nonconstant harmonic map from  $S^2$  to itself) but also because

$$\int u(t_i) \rightarrow \bar{w} := \int w$$

we have

$$|\bar{w}| \leq \frac{\kappa}{\sqrt{\pi}} [E(u_0) - 4\pi]^{\frac{1}{2}}.$$

But the Poincaré inequality tells us that

$$\int_{S^2} |w - \bar{w}|^2 \leq E(w),$$

and so integrating the inequality

$$1 = |w|^2 \leq 2|w - \bar{w}|^2 + 2|\bar{w}|^2,$$

we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} 4\pi &\leq 2 \int |w - \bar{w}|^2 + 8\pi |\bar{w}|^2 \\ &\leq 2E(w) + 8\kappa^2 [E(u_0) - 4\pi] \\ &\leq (2 + 8\kappa^2) [E(u_0) - 4\pi] \\ &\leq 2\pi, \end{aligned} \quad (3.3)$$

by (3.1), giving a contradiction.

We deduce that the flow exists for all time and converges smoothly to a Möbius map  $v$ . Here we only need convergence at some sequence of times  $t_i \rightarrow \infty$ , although we have convergence as  $t \rightarrow \infty$  by [9].

We can also pass the inequality (3.2) to the limit  $t \rightarrow \infty$  to give

$$|\bar{v}| \leq \frac{\kappa}{\sqrt{\pi}} [E(u_0) - 4\pi]^{\frac{1}{2}} \leq \kappa \left( \frac{\epsilon_0}{\pi} \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \leq \frac{1}{2},$$

by (3.1). This estimate prevents  $v$  from being too concentrated, and we can deduce that

$$|Dv| \leq c_0, \quad (3.4)$$

for some universal  $c_0$ . This follows by noticing that every Möbius map can be written as one of the maps  $\varphi_a$  followed by a rotation of  $S^2$ . Another way of making this precise

is by arguing by contradiction: If such an estimate (3.4) were not true, then we would take a sequence of Möbius maps  $v_i$  with  $|\bar{v}_i| \leq \frac{1}{2}$  but with  $\sup |Dv_i| \rightarrow \infty$ . After a bubbling analysis (passing to a subsequence) the maps  $v_i$  would converge weakly in  $W^{1,2}$  to a constant map  $v_\infty : S^2 \rightarrow S^2$  with  $|\bar{v}_\infty| \leq \frac{1}{2}$ , a contradiction.

Returning to (2.3), we find that  $\|u_0 - v\|_{L^2}^2 \leq 4\kappa^2[E(u_0) - 4\pi]$ . But we can also compute

$$\int |D(u_0 - v)|^2 = \int |Du_0|^2 + \int |Dv|^2 - 2 \int \langle Du_0, Dv \rangle$$

and because  $-\Delta v = v|Dv|^2$ , we can handle the final term using

$$\begin{aligned} -2 \int \langle Du_0, Dv \rangle &= -2 \int u_0(-\Delta v) = -2 \int u_0 v |Dv|^2 \\ &= \int |u_0 - v|^2 |Dv|^2 - 2 \int |Dv|^2, \end{aligned} \tag{3.5}$$

where we have used that  $|u_0| = |v| = 1$ . Combining, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \int |D(u_0 - v)|^2 &= \int |Du_0|^2 - \int |Dv|^2 + \int |u_0 - v|^2 |Dv|^2 \\ &\leq 2[E(u_0) - 4\pi] + c_0^2 \|u_0 - v\|_{L^2}^2 \\ &\leq C[E(u_0) - 4\pi], \end{aligned} \tag{3.6}$$

for universal  $C$ . □

**Remark 3.1.** At the start of the argument we balanced our map to have ‘centre of mass’ at the origin. Without this step we could expect the harmonic map flow to generate a finite-time singularity. Indeed in [8, Theorem 5.5] we showed that for arbitrarily small  $\epsilon_0 > 0$ , there exists a smooth degree one map  $u_0 : S^2 \rightarrow S^2$  with  $E(u_0) < 4\pi + \epsilon_0$  such that the subsequent harmonic map flow must develop a singularity in finite time.

## References

- [1] Anne Bernard-Mantel, Cyrill B. Muratov and Thilo M. Simon, *A quantitative description of skyrmions in ultrathin ferromagnetic films and rigidity of degree  $\pm 1$  harmonic maps from  $\mathbb{R}^2$  to  $S^2$* . <https://arxiv.org/abs/1912.09854>
- [2] J. Eells and J. H. Sampson, *Harmonic mappings of Riemannian manifolds*. Amer. J. Math. **86** (1964) 109–160.
- [3] P. Li and S.-T. Yau, *A new conformal invariant and its applications to the Willmore conjecture and the first eigenvalue of compact surfaces*. Inventiones math. **69** (1982) 269–291.
- [4] R. Schoen and K. Uhlenbeck, *Boundary regularity and the Dirichlet problem for harmonic maps*. J. Differential Geometry, **18** (1983) 253–268.
- [5] L. Simon *Asymptotics for a Class of Non-Linear Evolution Equations, with Applications to Geometric Problems*. Annals of Math. **118** (1983) 525–571.

- [6] M. Struwe, *On the evolution of harmonic mappings of Riemannian surfaces*. Comment. Math. Helv. **60** (1985) 558–581.
- [7] M. Struwe, ‘Variational methods.’ Fourth edition. Springer 2008.
- [8] P.M. Topping, *The harmonic map heat flow from surfaces*. PhD thesis (1996). <https://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/50788>
- [9] P.M. Topping, *Rigidity in the harmonic map heat flow*. J. Differential Geometry, **45** (1997) 593–610
- [10] P. M. Topping, *Reverse bubbling and nonuniqueness in the harmonic map flow*. I.M.R.N. **10** (2002) 505–520.
- [11] P.M. Topping, *Repulsion and quantization in almost-harmonic maps, and asymptotics of the harmonic map flow*. **159** (2004) 465–534.

MATHEMATICS INSTITUTE, UNIVERSITY OF WARWICK, COVENTRY, CV4 7AL, UK